

# Judges' comments

#### Ian McCartney MP

Hilary Fisher Director, End Child Poverty

Stephen Hayward Consumer Correspondent, Sunday Mirror

Len Mulholland Political Reporter, guardian.co.uk

Ellie Campbell-Barr Journal Editor, NUT





## Best journal or magazine

#### WINNER

#### FBU Firefighter

Firefighter sets out to enthuse, inform, educate, organise and entertain, and it does so in spades. The magazine depicts an active, dynamic union through an interesting variety of features, passionate regular columns, fire brigade gossip and an authoritative use of 'members' voice' throughout. The design is clear and dramatic photos are used to good effect. A truly excellent read.

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### **USDAW** Arena

A hard-hitting mag with a soft focus. The design is confident and inviting and the reporting bright and breezy. But what makes *Arena* really stand out is the unashamed emphasis on the benefits and positive impacts of union membership, with great use of members' real life stories. A magazine that makes you want to join the union.

#### COMMENDED

#### Nautilus UK Telegraph

An exciting, hard-hitting newspaper layout makes the Telegraph accessible and highly readable. The content is just as good, with a considered mix of union articles and essential reading for the wider shipping industry, including an excellent and thoroughly researched four-page piece on piracy. A bigbudget publication that turns over a healthy profit.

#### **ATL** Report

A striking cover for an attractive magazine packed with interest and information for members. The news pages are varied and fresh and the lead feature is hard-hitting, provocative and well illustrated.

#### **BALPA** The Log

The glossy feel, attractive design and number of leisure-based features gives *The Log* more of a consumer mag feel than other entries in this category. With some great pictures and solid, well-written content, the title drew good marks from the judges. One guestioned how the magazine would further the aims of the union.

#### **BECTU** Stage Screen and Radio

Professionally produced and nicely designed with a powerful front cover. The 'big-name' lead feature and positively written mix of insightful and pithy articles make this an essential read for members.

#### Connect Connected

Quality design and print – especially impressive given the budget – and plenty of news and advice. The judges wondered whether the title might benefit from a more obvious relationship with members, including more letters, real-life stories and case studies.

#### **CSP** Frontline

A brilliant example of a 'must-read' sector-specific publication. Stylishly understated and confident design, quality print and comprehensive information matched with great advertising – an impressive 12 pages of recruitments ads – make this a mag that would easily hold its own on the news-stand. Great green credentials too!

#### CWU Voice

Its clear, no-nonsense newspaper-style design, good writing, detailed analysis of industry news and powerful letters page make Voice a highly readable and authoritative mouthpiece for CWU members. A special mention went to the "particularly interesting" and attractive Women's Talk supplement.

#### **EIS** Scottish Educational Journal

The uncoated paper, muted colour palette and some nice photos give Scottish Education Journal a high quality feel. The content is engaging and varied, providing a well-informed talking shop for teachers.

#### **Equity** Equity

The magazine showcases an active and lively union. The cover mount DVD is superb – with a big name sure to give a union initiative a push. There is lots to read, all of it interesting, and a very lively letters page, but the body text is small, some of the pages feel busy, and the overall publication could benefit from improved layout and signposting.

#### FDA Public Service Magazine

Stylish design, good writing, strong illustrative material and high quality, glossy print make for an enjoyable and informative read. Nice leisure pages and powerful opinion pieces, although a shame to see just one letter.

#### **NASUWT** Teaching Today

A good all-round read, with interesting copy and informative articles on union activity. However, the judges felt the layout to be a little old-fashioned and busy, and that a facelift would help the content really shine.

#### **NUJ** Journalist

A wide range of very well written and attention-grabbing articles on everything from press freedom to pay and conditions in newsrooms. Well-presented union news and features, with details of campaign outcomes and a lively letters page, suggest a publication very much in touch with members.

#### **PCS** Activate

Does exactly what it says on the tin: provides well prepared advice for rank-and-file activists. A good campaigning magazine with strong pictures and clear layout, which could nevertheless benefit, one judge thought, from a few more case studies and real-life stories.

#### **Prospect** Profile

Packed with useful and engaging content reflecting a lively and active union, Profile has strong, bright news pages, a great cover and confident, accessible design.

#### **RMT** RMT News

A good mix of campaign news stories and solid in-depth interviews, but the overall feel is a bit 'traditional'. Adding more case studies, pull quotes and more imaginative imagery would give the mag new vitality. More member feedback generally would be welcome.

#### **SoR** Synergy News

A magazine with a professional feel, offering members a wealth of information, especially about jobs and courses. The articles are well written, but judges wanted to see more news stories, and thought the masthead a little old fashioned.

#### TSSA TSSA Journal

A clean layout with a host of strong articles offering lots for members to engage with - including a positive editorial page, a problems page and book reviews. Judges felt the quality of photos was a little disappointing and that the overall presentation of the publication – including the paper used – could have been better.

#### **UCATT** Building Worker

Great cover photo that opens a magazine packed with interesting news about union activity, the building industry and politics. Good to see an international perspective to stories in a mag that is clearly an outspoken advocate for workers' rights. One judge wanted to see a more obvious editorial 'voice' – an editor who readers and members could contact.

#### **UCU** UC

An opinion splitter: one judge thought this the best of the bunch, a "very, very good publication that hits all the right buttons". Others felt it had engaging content but could be improved with a more striking cover, higher quality paper, and a strong central feature. All agreed that the International Women's Day supplement was excellent.

#### **UNISON** U magazine

A strong and positive 'union' feel pervades this nicely laid out and accessible publication, with solid content and good photos. The personalised profile stories are excellent, as is the Did You Know? column. A magazine that manages the tricky feat of appealing to all levels of union members – from the activist to the rank-and-file member. Better paper quality would up its game even more.

#### **Unite** Landworker

A colourful, bright and clear magazine with good photos, a wide range of informative articles and an obvious campaigning zeal. It offers a welcome (and well informed) contrast to the glossy image of the countryside so often portrayed in lifestyle magazines.

#### **Unite** United

With so many members in such varied sectors, it's a big ask of **United** to cover so much ground in an interesting and engaging way, but it does so, with a good range of content, strong design, great photos and some very timely and relevant features directly linked to members' lives. One judge quipped: "Like another United boss, the editor has pulled off a tough job."

### Best feature

#### WINNER

#### **PCS** What's up with our Pay?

An important case for higher pay in the civil service argued strongly and concisely, with powerful case studies from members. The presentation is exemplary – with excellent use of subheads, tables and quotes, all helping to make the long piece digestible. The use of readers' letters reinforces an already strong argument, and the union's work is both promoted and supported throughout. An excellent feature.

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### Nautilus UK Special Report: Piracy

A topical and important issue comprehensively covered, with a nice mix of fact, opinion and case studies. Strong research and the powerful first-hand accounts from front-line personnel give the article added weight. One judge wanted the images to be more dramatic, but conceded such photos might be hard to come by.

#### COMMENDED

#### **BECTU** Taking Liberties

A well-written, carefully researched and balanced piece, asking important topical questions about the relationship between police and the press. The photos are excellent, adding much to the text, and there is enough in-depth indication of positive action being taken by the union.

#### ATL Goals, Games and Guidelines

A nice range of interviewees in a feature that raises interesting questions about how infant school children are taught. Breaking the text by using subheads might help make the piece more digestible.

#### **BALPA** Reaching for the Sky

An illuminating profile piece with a genuinely interesting subject matter, which is nicely presented, and is accompanied by great images. A good read for everyone – not just airline pilots.

#### **Connect** Justice for Colombia

The judges loved the topic and wanted to read more, but it lacked sufficient detail or enough in-depth analysis to make it more thought-provoking. Quotes and case studies would have helped too.

#### **CSP** Road to the Paralympics

An interesting and timely feature, enhanced by a good use of case studies, quotes and photos.

#### CWU Law Needs More Teeth

A truly shocking account of postal workers being mauled by dogs, with equally shocking accompanying images. This is a real 'talking point' feature built on well researched real-life experiences that convey the union's views on the issue. No real outline of potential solutions though, which would have made the piece stronger still.

#### FBU Defend Control Jobs

A well researched and nicely written piece of campaigning journalism with a strong union feel. Well argued, with powerful quotes, facts and case studies, the article raises serious questions about fire service reorganisation. Good photos raise the game still further.

#### FDA Precarious Peace Work

A fascinating and informative feature that is both well written and clearly presented. One judge was unsure how it promoted the union or supported its members in any practical way.

#### **NASUWT** Prejudice-Related Bullying

A worthwhile article that promotes the union's research and campaigning activities, although it reads more like a report than a journalistic feature. The inclusion of some case studies and quotes from those subject to bullying would give more authority and interest to the piece.

# **Prospect** What do Young People Want from their Union?

A competently put together piece that does a good job of communicating an important, but not particularly 'sexy' issue for unions. The design and layout (particularly the pictures of young members) enliven the article, and the inclusion of member stories add human interest. The piece lacks a punchy conclusion.

#### **SoR** The Big Breakthrough

The feature showcases important and positive union work, but the information feels densely packed and one judge wondered how many members would finish reading the whole article.

#### **TSSA** Whose Oil is it Anyway?

A diligently researched, well-written and mature piece from a 16-year-old, albeit slightly lacking in balance. Would have been even stronger with exclusive quotes — from the office of the former and current mayors, for example.

#### **UCATT** Big Bosses, Big Money

A shocking indictment of fat-cat directors and their pay that is presented clearly and concisely. The inclusion of member views is a nice touch, but there is no naming and shaming of guilty parties, nor much explanation of what the union is doing to tackle the issue.

# **UNISON** Making Ends Meet: Low-Paid Members Speak Out

A friendly, chatty writing style, attractive presentation and effective use of members' case studies combine to make this a powerful piece. The issue — the plight of low-paid workers in the UK — is a pertinent one and the arguments are all clearly presented.

#### **Unite** Sometimes We Cry

A powerful, well-written story that raises important questions about the conviction of five Cubans in the UK. The scene-setting and quotes are strong in a piece that is a great showcase for international trade union work. Slightly let down by poor subbing/proofing.

#### **USDAW** Battling Breast Cancer

This personal account of one woman's battle with breast cancer illustrates the part unions can play in raising awareness of the illness. A friendly and positive style – with essential information picked out in bullets – make this a strong, readable feature.

# Best use of a photo or illustration

#### WINNER

#### **BECTU** Photographer: Marc Vallée

A striking image — well placed, and with good headline support — that powerfully illustrates the police force's sometimes heavy-handed approach towards media workers. The judges were particularly impressed by the fact that this was a real, and non-staged or adapted, photo of an actual event.

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### TSSA Photographer: Robin Hammond/Panos

An extraordinary and poignant photographic representation of rampant inflation in Zimbabwe, crystallising a complex issue into a single image. It is given added punch by its accompanying cover text. Superb.

#### COMMENDED

#### NUJ Photographer: Paul Box; Montage: John Harris/reportdigital.co.uk

Bold, clear and powerfully supported by its cover-line, this confidently composed image raises questions about the police's relationship with the media and is everything a front page photo should be.

#### CSP Illustration by Samara Bryan/The Art Market

A simple, arresting and considered graphic that vividly illustrates the pain associated with back injury.

#### CWU Illustration by Howard Burns

Clever and imaginative montage pastiche of a real-life banking advert to reflect the attitude of a new employer towards faceless, 'moveable' and ultimately disposable staff. Very

#### FBU Photographer: Dave Thompson/PA

A strong, evocative image with iconic composition. However many times you see this kind of image it never fails to capture the desolation and sadness of the unspeakable war crimes that took place in Nazi Germany. Used well in context too.

#### FDA Illustration by Lexographic

Evocative and imaginative digital montage that both supports and enhances the accompanying feature, asking what Whitehall is doing to reduce its carbon emissions.

#### **NASUWT** Illustration by Simon Boothe

A strong, eve-catching and colourful poster designed to draw potential members' attention to the union by illustrating many of the challenges of life 'at the chalk-face'.

#### **PCS** Illustration by Clifford Harper

A beautiful and striking illustration that reflects the inequity of the global downturn, and shows the disproportionate impact it has had on hard working families.

#### **Prospect** Photographer: Eleanor Bentall, with Simon Crosby

A forceful cover image with a strikingly simple message on low pay. One judge commented: "The best pictures speak a thousand words. This one does even better than that."

#### **RMT** Photographer: Andrew Wiard

A personable, union-focused image that will appeal to members. Judges felt its impact was hampered by the other smaller pictures on the cover.

#### **UCU** Illustration by Lizzie Finn

Work/life balance illustrated in a novel way. One judge worried the image was too busy and didn't quite work (although they also noted that the accompanying article was excellent).

#### UNISON Photographer: John Harris/reportdigital. co.uk

All judges were impressed with this vibrant image of dancers at Tolpuddle, which captures a sense of friendship, fun, solidarity and hope, and shows that unions are not just about meetings, speeches and picket lines.

#### Unite Photographer: Simon Clark

A nicely captured portrait that draws the reader into the story and gives an upbeat insight into the lives of grassroots members who find a 'family' in the union.

#### **USDAW** Photographer: Stephen Walker

A group photo, which manages at the same time to highlight the aims of a key campaign, and also to give an overriding impression of a busy, open and proactive union. A tricky brief well solved.

# Best one-off publication

#### WINNER

#### **UCU** International Women's Day wallchart

A brilliant, well-designed and hyper-informative wallchart packed with facts and great photos that will appeal to members and non-members alike. Lots of information is conveyed in a clear and accessible way. The size of the print run indicates how well received it has been.

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### **USDAW** Legal Plus reps pack

A comprehensive and genuinely useful set of publications in which the writing, layout and overall presentation are all clear and appealing. This positive pack offers great support to union reps and members on injury claims and really promotes the benefits of union membership.

#### COMMENDED

#### FBU Easy Targets

A powerful research report that was successful in generating considerable media interest. Shocking statistics from the LRD are supported by equally shocking real-life stories. The layout is clean and clear, with imaginative page furniture that ensures the amount of information conveyed never overwhelms. Photos are used to great effect.

#### BECTU Cardiff Media Fair 2009 flyer

A clear, concise and attractively presented leaflet with eyecatching photos that does its job well. The double-sided English/Welsh application form is a nice touch.

#### **CSP** Charting the Future of Physiotherapy

A well-written, neat little booklet with clear and consistent design.

#### CWU Voice Extra (Keep the Post Public)

The montage of MP photos is a clever idea, making for a striking, eye-catching cover. The publication reflects an active and campaigning union, and the strong arguments about postal reform are clearly presented.

#### **Equity** Review of the Year 2009

This annual review is enhanced by the inclusion of some powerful stories from and about members. It reflects the broad work of the union and includes some good photos. But there are also some rather poor photos, some pages feel too text heavy and some of the headline font effects feel a little unnecessary.

#### FDA FDA 2008 Annual Report

A modern design featuring a good use of white space, with information clearly presented. The judges wondered whether on balance it might have been a little text heavy, and whether some photos would open the publication to more readers.

#### **NASUWT** Student Voice

An informative booklet for members that is well written and clearly presented. A more lively and colourful design and a stronger cover would have been nice, as would the inclusion of more members' views and experiences.

#### PCS DVLA - Equal Pay Campaign

The stand-up desk road signs are clever, well designed and convey clear, concise information and action points for members. The format is eye-catching with a high novelty value. A solid, cost-effective publication for a quality campaign.

#### **Prospect** Explore New Frontiers

An interesting attempt to engage an audience with humour, supported by a bright illustration. The judges weren't sure if the joke was strong enough.

#### RMT Say no to EU rail privatisation

Interesting use of a DVD as a publication. High publication values, although unclear who the audience is. Is it members? Politicians? European trade unions? More info on the packaging regarding the length and content of the films would also help. Would have been more appropriately entered into the Best use of e-communications category.

## Best campaign

#### WINNER

#### **USDAW** Check Out Learning

A great name for a campaign that gets everything right. The objectives are clear and the outcomes will have significant long-term benefits for the union, developing both the union and the individual and collective skills of its members. User empowerment permeates the materials, which feature photos and experiences of and from members. One judge wrote: "Unions are at their best when they show members that they are not just ordinary people, but extraordinary people, and this campaign does that in spades."

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### FBU Safer firefighters; safer communities

This campaign – which has a clear set of objectives and outcomes – took a traditional approach to enact action among opinion formers and decision makers. An excellently presented and researched report and its recommendations formed the basis of a superlative lobby of Parliament, backed by strong member participation. A well-resourced campaign that achieved its objectives on a hugely important issue.

#### COMMENDED

#### **NASUWT** Is your school breaking the law?

An extremely well conceived campaign that empowered members, engaged with the wider education community, caught the imagination of MPs and Ministers and resulted in a significant step forward for the unions and its members. Supporting material sends out a strong message, and contains useful information. While the campaign achieved its goals, one judge wondered whether ministerial commitment might already have been in place before the campaign started.

#### **ATL** Country Strife – tackling rural poverty

Well chosen subject matter and a clear set of objectives. Creative use of village setting to get message across and the material is well thought out. On the downside, it's not clear how many MPs attended fringe events, there's not much for the member or village citizen to get involved with and the impact of the campaign has not been clearly measured.

#### **BECTU** Meet the Indies

A great idea for an event, with carefully considered objectives and outcomes and excellent links to members, enabling them to engage easily with the campaign objectives. Felt more like a campaign activity, rather than a campaign in itself. However, for a limited investment, and with the development of strategic partnerships, the follow-up to this event could end up being genuinely life changing for members.

#### CWU Power up for Agency Pay

A sustained campaign, backed by good research, which has led to commitments from Government to improve the lot of agency workers, while raising the profile of some of the most exploited and under-paid workers. It features some imaginative activities - such as the Christmas Carol - though judges would like to have seen more evidence of the wider impact of the campaign, particularly on public perceptions, and of potential union recruitment arising from the campaign.

#### **Equity** Gagging for Equity

This campaign is the basis of what promises to be a solid and imaginative recruitment drive, featuring a great use of celebrity to push the union message. The CD is excellent. Despite this, it was felt that it was difficult to meaningfully gauge outcomes this early in the campaign. Judges questioned how it will engage current members and would like to have seen targets with which to judge ultimate success. They wondered if next year would be a better time to submit this promising entry.

#### **PCS** Pay up for Public Servants

An effective and solid trade union campaign, with clear objectives and outcomes. Members are both engaged and empowered – with campaign literature packed with member case studies and quotes. Positive impacts show that the campaign achieved its goals, although one judge wanted to see evidence of press coverage.

#### **Prospect** Bargaining for international development

A brave project that is executed excellently, with inspiring and practical objectives, attractive materials and clear signs of user engagement. Building relationships with Government and NGOs will shore up support in the medium term. At present it is too early to judge campaign success and the judges were keen that this be re-entered next year with evidence of what has been achieved.

#### **UCU** Nottingham Trent University fight for recognition

An effective union campaign on a limited budget that fully engaged members and held appeal for potential new members. Excellent use of both traditional and more modern techniques on a campaign that could not be have been allowed to fail: its implications on the wider union movement were significant. Would have been good to see evidence of media coverage, rather than a series of press releases.

#### Best website

#### WINNER

#### PCS www.pcs.org.uk

A well-designed site reflecting a modern, campaigning and active trade union. The many thousands of pages are clearly organised and careful attention has been paid to accessibility. The wide range of toolkits and resources are useful and the online debates are a nice addition. Great blog too!

#### **HIGHLY COMMENDED**

#### FDA www.fda.org.uk

Very clear and easy to use. The design is fresh, with effective use of photos and illustrations. The members' area is packed with useful info, as are the lively discussion forums, blogs and community areas. The site scores highly on accessibility too. One judge wondered if the press release area could be repopulated with news stories of more immediate relevance to members.

#### COMMENDED

#### CWU www.cwu.org

A clearly laid out site with a strong campaigning feel. The CWU TV area is excellent, featuring slick, professional and very high production values. The content is also extremely watchable.

#### **ATL** www.atl.org.uk

A bright, lively and attractive homepage reflecting a modern, active and positive union. As a whole the site is easy to navigate and up-to-date, packed with useful information. Could be further enhanced with a greater use of 2.0 technologies, like blogs and forums.

#### BALPA www.balpa.org

A fresh design for a website that is easy to navigate and pleasant to use. The document library is comprehensive and useful, while the personalised 'my airline' area is a nice touch. Using more creative visuals might help draw more readers in.

#### Nautilus UK www.nautilusuk.org

A confident website with a range of information of obvious interest to readers. The implementation of additional web 2.0 technologies would open the site further and increase interactivity. Love the Tweets though!

#### **SoR** www.sor.org.uk

The site works fine and has a strong members' section. Overall though, the design feels a little old fashioned, and the inclusion of more recent web developments, like blogs and videos, would be welcome.

#### **UCU** www.ucu.org.uk

An attractive offering with a strong campaigning feel. The dropdown menus are a little slow and the site is starting to feel a bit dated compared to others in the category. Embracing 2.0 will inject a more modern feel. More visuals would help lift the design.

#### **USDAW** www.usdaw.org.uk/member services/ legal services

This site isn't the union's main website – so doesn't really meet the entry criteria. The main site, www.usdaw.org.uk, is rather busy, with lines that are too long and read uncomfortably. The legal services pages are clearer – with good text – but browsing involves a lot of clicking back and forth. Some great member photo galleries though.

## Best use of e-communications

#### WINNER

#### CWU Title of communication: CWUTV

An innovative idea for engaging members and showcasing CWU campaign activity delivered in a slick and professional way. Very accessible and easy to watch. Overall, an inspired way of highlighting activism.

#### HIGHLY COMMENDED

#### FBU Title of communication: FBUtube

A good use of YouTube to enable members to share their activities and get the FBU message across. The videos are well produced, pithy and tight, despite being made on a limited budget. Greater use could be made of the vids by linking them through to the main union website, and it would be nice to see additional online marketing to boost the number of views. May also be nice to add some more action videos?

#### CSP CSP email news bulletin

A clearly written email news bulletin aimed at engaging and informing members. The links are carefully chosen to interest readers. Not so sure the narrow format makes the most of the medium and the right hand column could be used to greater effect.

#### **NASUWT** Monthly Benefits and Services ezine

Very informative site for NASUWT members, with useful links to benefits and services of potential interest to members. However, once a visitor has looked round there's not much to keep them engaged, or prompt return visits, and the site has something of an 'e-shop' feel to it. Maybe some 2.0 integration would help keep the content fresh?

#### PCS Integration of e-activist campaigning software into the PCS website

An informative site that makes supporting PCS campaigns very easy. The integration with online activity on the main website is also strong.

#### **Prospect** Multimedia recruitment presentation

Clever use of a CD to recruit members among younger age ranges. The interactivity is good, with cleverly implemented software to enable reps to add their own slides relevant to events they are organising. Clear information is given, albeit a little formal in tone. It's too early to establish how effective it will be, but the signs are all good.

#### SoR StudentTalk

A good attempt at engaging younger members with this carefully targeted e-bulletin. Although the judges felt even more information could be included, it is clearly being read, with an increasing number of readers signing up.

#### TSSA TSSA e-journal

A strong publication featuring a range of information and a variety of very readable articles. Good design and a nice use of photos. That said, it retains the feel of a print magazine online, and more use of interactive elements and 2.0 features would enable the publication to fully benefit from its medium.

#### **Unite** Digimag

A well written magazine featuring a good range of information. The page turning is clever but tends to reinforce the impression that this is a print magazine online. Like the TSSA e-journal, the judges felt a greater use of interactivity would optimise this for the web – like the ability to move directly from the contents page to an article of interest in just one click.